

TESS Follow-up Observing Program

TFOP SG1 Ground-based Time-series Photometry: Goals, Status, Results and Your TESS Paper

Karen Collins CfA/SAO karen.collins@cfa.harvard.edu



TFOP SG1 Team

SG1 Team is
 ~200 members
 strong

- Professional astronomers
- Student astronomers
- Citizen astronomers
- Ground-based transit surveys







• Goals:

- Identify photometric false positives
- Confirm events on-target
- Refine ephemerides
- Measure TTVs
- Measure transit depths to confirm TESS deblending factor
- Verify transit depth achromaticity





- Search stars within 2.5 arcmin of target for nearby EBs (NEBs)
- If found 1st time => SG1 disposition **PNEB**
- If found 2nd time => SG1 disposition NEB









SG1 Dispositioning Process

SG1 Goals are dependent on transit depth

- Ground-based sensitivity general threshold
 - ~1000 ppm (1 ppt or ~1 mmag)
- 40% of <4 R_E TOIs > 1 ppt
- 75% all TOIs > 1 ppt
- Can also contribute at < 1 ppt





SG1 Dispositioning Process

SG1 Goals are transit depth dependent

- Ground-based sensitivity general threshold
 - ~1000 ppm (1 ppt or ~1 mmag)
- 40% of <4 R_E TOIs > 1 ppt
- ◆ 75% all TOIs > 1 ppt
- Can also contribute at < 1 ppt





• For transit depths > 1 ppt

- Primary goal is to confirm transit on target
 - Confirmed and no follow-up aperture contamination
 => VPC = Verified Planet Candidate (SG1 disposition)
 - Confirmed but follow-up aperture is contaminated with known nearby star => VPC-
 - Confirmed off target
 > NEB = nearby eclipsing binary
- Secondary goal is a depth chromaticity check
 - No significant filter dependent depth => VPC+
 - Significant filter dependent depth => **BEB** = blended (in the follow-up aperture) EB false positive



VPC Examples

Transits detected on target => VPC disposition (often with 1-2" apertures)



Credit: Kevin Collins, Vanderbilt University/George Mason University

Credit: Jonathan Irwin





Achromatic Transits detected on target => **VPC+** disposition



Credit: Dennis Conti, Citizen Astronomer

2019 August 01



BEB Examples

Examples of strong chromaticity detections => **BEB** False Positive



Credit: Kevin Collins, Vanderbilt University



Ephemeris Refinement

- Several TOIs already have > 2-hour uncertainty
- Ephemeris is refined with each SG1 observation
- Uncertainty generally reduced by ~90%
- Chart below includes SG1 refinements





TTV Detections

- TOI-216b and TOI-216c system
- SG1 citizen astronomers contributed to TTV measurements



Dawson et al. 2019



• For transit depths < 1 ppt

- Primary goal is to check all Gaia DR2 star locations within 2.5 arcmin of the target for NEBs
 - Confirmation of no NEBs (no Gaia stars blended in target PSF)
 => CPC = Cleared Planet Candidate
 - Confirmed but target star PSF is contaminated with known nearby star => CPC-
 - Confirmed off target (1st time)
 => PNEB = possible nearby eclipsing binary
 - Confirmed off target (2nd time)
 > NEB = nearby eclipsing binary





- Light curves of all stars within 2.5 arcmin of target are available on ExoFOP-TESS
- Box transit models show depth needed to produce TESS detection







SG1 TOI List Google Sheet

- Any TFOP member can request access (send me your google affiliated email address)
- Contains all SG1 TOIs
 - All Mission TOIs
 - Various special request candidates
- Current SG1 priority
- Current SG1 disposition
- Observing history
- Current ephemeris uncertainty
- NOTE: all confirmed FPs are listed on ExoFOP-TESS

Target	TIC	TOI	Pipe- line	Sec- tor	Priority	Dis-po s-ition	Vmag	Depth (ppm)	Р	Durat ion (hrs)	Rp (R_E arth)	Publication Status	N Obs	Comments	Cur Eph Unc (min)
25375553.01	25375553	143.01	QLP	S1	3	KP VPC	10.251	6939	2.3109	3.422	9.7		4	WASP-111 Peter Nelson observed a full transit on 20180914 in V and found a tentitive detection of the transit on target. Bob Massey observe a full transit on 20180914 in V and found a deeper transit, but with 14 ppt RMS. Fran and the TRAPPIST-South team observed a full transit on 20180928 in 2 with an ref. 5" aperture. A -5 ppt event was detected on target. No Gaia stars are contaminating the follow-up aperture. TG Tan observed an inconclusice ingress on 20181121 in V. The next observation should be a full transit in g/B to check for a chromatic depth.	92
260985861.01	260985861	149.01	QLP	S1	5	VPC	10.727	5082	3.3402	4.077			4	Giovanni Isopi and Franco Mallia observed an ingress on 20181001 and found an apparent on-time -3 ppt ingress on target in an r=8° aperture. That depth should be considered a rough fit and possibly consistent with the TESS depth. No obvious potential NEBS were found down to ~ dmag-7.5. See Giovann's dmag + RMS analysis for details. Howie Relles also observed this TOI and with in-transit and partial egress coverage. There is an apparent egress starting at about the right time and with a depth of at least 5 ppt. Fran and the TRAPPIST team observed a full transit on 20181114 in Rc and found a 5 ppt ~on-time event. Chris Sockdale observe in egress+50% and found an apparent ~10 ppt evnt on target (but depth is uncertain). Gaia reports this system has two almost equal brightness neighbors that are separated by 1° and with dmag=0.1, so the opth would be ~twice what is reported by TESS. Gaia does not give a radius for either star. A SOAR speckle image on ExoFOP confirms the 1° neighbor. Retired as a VPC, but note that the target is two stars.	65
271893367.01	271893367	150.01	QLP	S1	5	VPC+	11.39	7386	5.8576	5.818	15.0	Kossakowski TOI-150b TOI-163b In Prep Canas non-TESS TOI-150.01 Accepted	3	Kevin Collins reduced an LCO-CTIO-1m egress + 60% on 20181109 in Zs and found a 6.6 ppt event on time and on target with an r=5.84" aperture which is not contaminated by any Caia stars. Howie Relles observed the same partial event in ip from an LCO-CTIO-1m and found a ~6 ppt event on time and on target within a 19.5" aperture. Fran observed a full transit with meridian flip in u' on 20181219 and found a ~5 ppt event on target using a 4.6" aperture. The meridian flip and short post-egress baseline could make the model depth uncertain and alternate models give 6.5 and 7.5 ppt. Phil Evans observed a full in B on 20190130 in B and found a 6.5" aperture. No more observations needed.	40
												Huang Pi Mensae b			
261136679.01	261136679	144.01	SPOC	SI	5	P	5.65	249	6.2666	3.093	1.9	Accepted	0	HD 39091 (pi Mensae), RV confirmed planet pi Mensae b (Huang et al. 2018). Kris Helminiak observed a full transit in V on 20181031 using deep exposures that saturated the target star. One potential 80 ppt NEB was found at his T5 (73', PA=108, dmag=6.33), but is apparently too faint and shallow to have caused the TESS detection. The next observations should check to see if the potential NEB returns, but otherwise this field has been cleared.	94
02403237.01	02403237	155.01	3F00	. 31		NED	10.55	1307	4 5070	2.137	2.1			Aso, attempt to community event on target. Kevin Collins reduced an LCO full transit observation on 20180914 in Z-band an found no event on target and. However, the dmag = 4.58 star 27" to the NNE (PA=17 degrees) shows a 175 ppt (paek depth) event, which if fully blended in the TESS aperture would produce a 2.5 ppt event. The NEB is probably not fully blended, so the TESS detected depth of 1.7 ppt	05
403287048.01	403287048	152.01	OLP	SI	5	NEB	11.734	3667	7.0078	2 680	8.1		1	Chris Stockdale observed a full transit on 20181006 in Rc and found a convincing 100 ppt NEB with dmag=3.7 that is 43" WNW of the target. The duration, timing, and depth in the NEB are consistent with the 3.7 ppt event detected by TESS on the brighter target star. The neighbor star is TIC 403287050 at RA=332 332031 (22 0919.687) and Dec=-62 33091 (-62:19:48.33) and has Tmag=14.7 and Vmag=15.345. Gaia gives Teff=5841+/400 and Rstar=1.20+/0.15. Using the lower end of the planet radius, Rp=35.85 Re, so this TOI is an NEB rather than an NPC (mearby name candidate). Retired as an NFB	199
220518305.01	220518305	156.01	QLP	S1	5	SB1	10.721	18638	14.1489	3.765	21.8		0	Warm Jupiter candidate with a period of about 14 days. Avi's CHIRON RV data show this target to be an EB. Expired as SB1.	58
231081369.01	231081369	153.01	QLP	S1	5	BEB	12.217	6340	7.6323	1.656			5	Chris Stockdale observed an ingress plus 50-75% on 20180921 in Rc and found no NEBs down to dmag-5.5 and found no clear detection of the predicted 6 ppt transit on target within a scatter of ~4 ppt. Chris Stockdale observed a near full transit on 20181014 in Rc resulting in a 4.2 ppt event on target in an =6° aperture. An alternate interpretation of the light curve is sinusoidal variations given the pre-ingress OOT variations. No obvious NEBs were found	62
389525208.01	389525208	154.01	QLP	S1	5	NEB	10.493	5000	6.7471	2.343	41.3		1	Phil Evans observed a full transit on 20180915 in Rc and found a mid-transit 80 ppt flux decrement in Rc in a dmag=3.9 (Vmag=14.7) star 21* to the NW (PA=297). Retired as NEB.	44



SG1 TOI List Totals

TFOP SG1 TOTALS	TOTAL	S1	\$ 2	S 3	S 4	S 5	S 6	S 7	S 8	S 9	S10	S11	S12	S13
Total SG1 TOIs (excludes KPs and STPCs)	865	54	170	49	59	74	89	89	107	99	39	18	18	0
Level 1	296	12	47	28	27	28	33	22	33	41	12	6	7	0
Level 1	141	11	39	16	12	20	8	13	13	12	20	3	0	0
TOIs with 0 Observations (excludes KPs and STPCs) Level 1	420 155	8	38 8	16 12	29 15	45 20	57 25	63 9	54 20	62 29	19 6	12 3	17	0
SG1 Retired (excludes KPs and STPCs)	241	40	59	17	22	19	16	13	32	16	6	1	0	0
Level 1	624	8	15	32	37	55	6 73	6 76	8 75	83	33	17	18	0
Level 1	224	4	32	17	19	23	27	16	25	37	11	6	7	0
Total SG1 Observations	1106	186	349	83	51	61	60	85	89	65	39	12	1	0
Total SG1 Submitted Observations	1081	186	349	83	51	61	60	85	89	65	39	12	1	0
Total Pending Observations	25	0	0	42	18 0	16 0	16 0	36 0	26 0	24	10	0	0	0
Planets (excludes KPs)	27	9	12	0	2	1	0	1	1	1	0	0	0	0
P (Confirmed Planet)	22	8	8	0	2	1	0	1	1	1	0	0	0	0
Level 1	9	2	5	0	2	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
VP (Validated Planet)	5 4	1	4 3	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
KP (Known Planet)	132	20	24	10	13	1	16	11	4	10	13	10	0	0
Elevated to Other SGs	223	27	72	18	7	12	15	15	23	19	10	5	0	0
VPC+ (SG1 Verified Achromatic PC)	36	10	8	3	1	1	0	4	2	3	2	2	0	0
VPC (SG1 Verified PC on target)	11 108	2 11	2 38	2 6	2	7	7	5	12	2 12	6	2	0	0
Level 1 VPC- (SG1 Verified PC w/contaminated aperture)	23 5	2	7	2	1	1	0	2	3	3	1	0	0	0
Level 1	1	0	1	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
CPC (SG1 Cleared PC - no NEBs)	39	3	14	7 5	1	2	3	4	2	2	1	0	0	0
CPC- (SG1 Cleared PC outside target PSF)	4	0	0	2	0	0	1	0	1	0	0	0	0	0
Level 1 PPC (SG1 Promising PC)	31	3	11	2	3	2	1	0	5	0	0	1	0	0
Level 1	15	1	5	0	3	1	1	1	1	1	0	1	0	0
Not Elevated to Other SGs	472	4	63	22	31	46	62	66	54	69	24	13	18	0
PC (still a Planet Candidate)	453	2	55	22	31	46	59	65	52	67	24	12	18	0
PNEB (Possible NEB)	165	0	0	13	14	20	23	0	20	31 0	9	0	0	0
Level 1	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
STPC (Single Transit PC)	18	2	8	0	0	0	3	1	1	2	0	1 0	0	0
False Positives	160	16	31	8	19	15	15	8	30	12	5	1	0	0
NEB (Nearby EB)	63	3	9	1	13	6	9	3	15	4	0	0	0	0
NPC (Nearby PC)	22 12	3	3	1	6 1	3 1	3 1	3 0	4	1	0	0	0	0
Level 1	21	2	0	3	0	1	0	2	0	0	0	0	0	0
Level 1	21	2	0	0	0	0	0	2	0	0	0	0	0	0
BD (confirmed Brown Dwarf)	2	0	0	0	0	0	0	1	1	0	0	0	0	0
EB (too deep)	14	0	7	3	2	0	1	1	0	0	0	0	0	0
Level 1	32	0	2	0	2	0	1	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
Level 1	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
SB2 (multi-lined)	9	2	2	0	0	0	1	0	3	0	1	0	0	0
FA (false alarm)	7	1	0	0	0	1	1	0	3	1	0	0	0	0
Level 1	5	0	0	0	0	1	1	0	3	0	0	0	0	0

Chart	linked on	TESS Wiki
-------	-----------	------------------

• 865 (L1=296) SG1 TOIs (excluding KPs and STPCs)

- 1100+ (L1=375+) SG1 submitted observations
 - ~60% LCO observers
 - ~40% from non-LCO observers
- ~50% of TOIs have 1+ observations

◆ ~20% FPs

- See SG1 Related Posters:
 - Poster 5 McLeod et al.
 - Poster 7 Narita et al.
 - Poster 9 Waalkes et al.
 - Poster 11 Fukui et al.
 - Poster 12 Kielkopf et al.
 - Poster 19 Palle et al.
 - Poster 54 Kafka et al.



SG1 Data and Your TESS Paper

- Interested in a specific TOI?
 - Let me know early on and I can boost SG1 priority
- Recommend including constraints from follow-up in paper
 - Size of follow-up aperture (in arcsec) used to confirm event on target
 - FWHM of stars in follow-up imagery
 - Include light curves in global model
 - *Reduce ephemeris uncertainty by up to ~90%*
 - Verify TESS deblending factor via follow-up depths
 - Verify achromatic transit via multi-band follow-up
 - TTV constraints
- TOIs with depths less than ~1.0 ppt
 - The CPC status rules out NEBs
- We can help write SG1 observations and data reduction section and provide interpretation
- TFOP observers that contributed useful data, including ruling out of a false positive, should be offered coauthorship, even if you later confirmed the planet mass with RVs.
 - Check ExoFOP-TESS and SG1 Google Sheet
 - Ask me to help identify appropriate SG1 coauthors



Files (51)

Light Curve

Light_Curve

Light_Curve

Light Curve

Light_Curve

Light_Curve

Light Curve

Light_Curve

Light Curve

Light_Curve

Light_Curve

Type

+ Add new

File Name

Lead Author Resources for SG1 Observations

• SG1 TOI List

- Open to all TFOP members
- Email <u>karen.collins@cfa.harvard.edu</u> for access



SG1 Author Information (link on TESS Wiki Publication page)

Pedro J.	Amado	pja@laa.csic.es	\author(0000-0002-8388-6040)(Pedro J. Amado) \affiliation(instituto de Astrofísica de Andalucía-CSIC, Glorieta de la Astronomía s/n, Granada, E-18008, Spain)	Observatorio de Sierra Nevada, Granada, Spain
David	Baker	dbeker@austincollege.edu	lauthor(0000-002-2970-0532)(David Baker) laffiliation(Physics Department, Austin College, Sherman, TX 75090, USA)	Adams Observatory, Austin College
Khalid	Barkaoui	khalid barkaoui@doct uliege be	lauthor(Phalid Barkaovii) taffiliadon/Asteolology Research Unit, Université de Liège, 19C Alée du 6 Août, 4000 Liège, Belgium) taffiliadion(Juksimeden Observatory, High Energy Physics and Astrophysics Laboratory, Cadi Ayyad University, Marrakech, Morócco)	TRAPPIST-South, TRAPPIST-North and SPECULOOS-South Observatory
Zachary	Bates	zbates@gmu edu	(author/Zachary Bates) (affiliation/George Mason University, 4400 University Drive, Fairfax, VA, 22030 USA)	GMU
Daniel	Bayliss	d bayliss@warwick.ac.uk	\suthor(0000-0001-6023-1335)[Daniel Bayliss] \affiliation(Department of Physics, University of Warwick, Coventry CV4 7AL, UK)	
Serge	Bergeron	astrosberge3@gmail.com	\author(Serge Bergeron) \affiliation(American Association of Variable Star Observers, 49 Bay State Road, Cambridge, MA 02138, USA)	Astrosberge Private Observatory, Canada
Zach	Berta-Thompson	zach bertathompson@colorado edu	author(0000-0002-3321-4924)[Zachory Berta-Thompson] \affil[Department of Astrophysical and Planetary Sciences. University of Colorado, Boulder, CO 80309, USA]	
Lorenzo	Betti	zernolotibet@yahoo.it	lauthor(Lorenzo Betti) lattiliaton(Osservatorio Polifunzionale del Chianti (OPC), 50021 Barberino Val d'Elsa, Firenze, Italia) utilitation(Università di Firenze, Via Sansone 1. 50019 Sesto Fiorentino (Fi))	Osservatorio Polifunzionale del Chianti - OPC
Alfredo	Biagini	alfredo blagini93@live.it	lauthor(Alfredo Blaghi) Valfilaion(Osservatorio Polifunzionale del Chianti (OPC), 50021 Barberino Val d'Elsa, Firenzo, Italia) Valfilaion(Univenzià d'Elrenze, Via Sansone 1, 50015 Sesto Florentino (Fi))	Osservatorio Polifunzionale del Chianti - OPC
Valerio	Bozza	valboz@sa.infn.it	lauthor(0000-0003-4590-0136)(Valerio Bozza) 'latfiliadion(Dipartimento di Fisica "E.R. Calarindi". Universiti"a di Salerno, Via Giovanni Paolo II 132, 64064 Fisciano, Italy) 'uffiliadion(Situto Nazionale di Fisica Nucleare, Sezione di Napoli, Via Cintia, 80126 Napoli, Italy)	Salerno University Observatory
Carolyn	Brown	carolyn.brown@usq.edu.au	lauthor(0000-0001-6649-4631)[Carolyn J. Brown) laffiliation[University of Southern Queensland, Centre for Astrophysics, Toowoomba QLD 4350, Australia)	Minerva-Australis
Quentin	Changeat	quentin changeat 18@ucl.ac.uk	(author(Quentin Changeat) (affiliation(University College London, London, United Kingdom)	LCO network, Warrambungle Observatory, IC Astron
Heena	Chotani	hchotani@gmu.edu	lauthor(Heena Chotani) laffiliation(George Mason University, 4400 University Drive, Fairfax, VA, 22030 USA)	GMU
Jake	Clark	jake clark@usg edu au	author(0000-0003-3964-4658)(Jake T.\ Clark) \affiliation(University of Southern Queensland, Centre for Astrophysics, Toowoomba QLD 4350, Australia)	Minerva-Australis
		the second se		

ExoFOP-TESS

TIC167415965-01 20181213 LCD-SAAD-1m rp field zoomed.png

TIC167415965-01 20181213 LCD-SAAD-1m rp measurements NEB table.ts

TIC167415965-01 20181213 LCO-SAAO-1m rp lightcurve comps.pn

TIC167415965-01_20181213_LCO-SAAD-1m_rp_measurements.tbl

TIC167415965-01 20181213 LCO-SAAO-1m rp seeing profile T10.png

TIC167415965-01_20181213_LCO-SAAO-1m_rp_field.png

TIC167415965-01 20181213 LCO-SAAO-1m in.plottfe

TIC167415965-01_20181213_LCO-SAAO-1m_rp.aperture

TIC167415965-01 20181213 LCD-SAAO-1m rp wcs.fit

tic167415965-01_mko-cdk700_dmag-vs-unbinned_RMS.png tic167415965-01_mko-cdk700_ncb-search-table.bt

tic167415965-01 mko-cdk700 seeing-profile.pm

- Access to all SG1 reduced data files
- Must be TFOP member to access 1-year prop. data
- REMEMBER TO LOGIN TO SEE ALL FILES!

• SG1 Instrumentation Specs (link on Wiki Publication page)

Felipe	Murgas	fmurgas@iac.es	Teide Observatory	Telescopio Carlos Sánchez (TCS) - MuSCAT2 instrument	Spain	La Laguna, Tenerife	28 2999988	-16 50583131	2390	Atlantic/Canary - Canary Islands	
Pere	Guerra	pereguerra@gmail.com	Observatori Astronómic Albanyá	OAA	Spain	Albanyá, Girona	42.30722222	2.71138889	242	Europe/Madrid	Meade ACF
Pablo	Lewin	pablotwa@earthlink.net	The Maury Lewin Astronomical Observatory		USA	Glendora, CA	34.14208	-117.87211	226	America/Los Angeles/Western	Aplanatic, flat field Schmidt-Cass
Nikolay	Mishevskiy	nikastro@ukr.net	Private Astronomical Observ	atory (Ananjev L33)	Ukraine	Ananjev, Odessa st.	47.73619	29.954611	100	Europe/Kiev	Reflector Newton
Phil	Evans	phil@astrofizz.com	El Sauce		Chile	Coquimbo Province	-30.47111	70.765	1600	America/Santiago	CDK
Gregor	Srdoc	gregorsrdoc@gmail.com	Kotizarovci Observatory		Croatia	Viskovo	45.384516	14.411265	410	Europe/Zagreb	SCT
Jonathan	Swift	jswift@thacher.org	Thacher Observatory		USA	Ojal, CA	34.466806	-119.177361	495	America/Los Angeles/Western	Planewave Corrected Dall-Kirkham
Harvey	Patashnick	hdpatashnick@gmail.com	Patashnick Voorheesville Observatory	PVO	USA	Voorheesville, NY	42.64	-73.94	126	America/New_York - Eastern	Newtonian Cassegrain
Richard	Schwarz	rpschwarz@comcast.net	Patashnick Voorheesville Observatory	PVO	USA	Voorheesville, NY	42.64	-73.94	126	America/New_York - Eastern	Newtonian Cassegrain
Franco	Mallia	francomallia@tin.it	Campo Catino Astronomical Observatory	RC80	Italy	Guarcino (FR)	41 822083	13.32916	1500	Europe Central Time	Ritchey-Chretien
Emanuele	Pace	e pace@osservatoriochianti.it	Osservatorio Polifunzionale del Chianti	RC80	Italy	Barberino val d'Elsa (FI)	43.523099	11 244836	455	European Central Time	Ritchey-Chretien
Emanuele	Pace	e pace@osservatoriochianti.it	Osservatorio Polifunzionale del Chianti	RC80	Italy	Barberino val d'Elsa (FI)	43.523099	11.244836	455	European Central Time	Ritchey-Chretien
Franco	Malla	francomalila@tin it	Campo Catino Astronomical Observatory	TIE14	USA	Rodeo, NM	31.90722	-109 02111	1420	Americal/Denver - Mountain (most areas)	RC
Franco	Mallia	francomalia@tin.it	Campo Catino Astronomical Observatory	T17	Australia	Siding Spring	-31,2733	149.071	1122	Australia/Sydney	RC
Tiffany	Lewis	tiffanvlewisphd@amail.com	Wise Observatory	Jay Baum Rich (C28)	Israel	Mitzpe Ramon	30.596	34.763	875	Asia/Jerusalem	Centurion 28. by AstroWorks, USA

IOT

TOI 214 01

TOI 214.01

TOI 214.01

TOI 214.01

TOI 214.01

TO1 214 01

TOI 214.01

TOI 214.01

TOI 214.01

TOI 214 01

TOI 214.01

TOI 214.01

TIC

TIC 167415965 01

TIC 167415965.01

TIC 167415965.01